

## EMC5701 — KEY DEBATES IN COMPARATIVE EDUCATION

Start date: Monday 4<sup>th</sup> October 2010; End date: Monday 15<sup>th</sup> November 2010

**Co-Ordinating Lecturer:** Professor Ronald G. Sultana

**Value of study unit:** 5 ECTS

**Mode of Teaching:** Group seminars, student presentations, case study approaches

**Mode of Assessment:** Attendance and participation: 20%; Presentation (group or individual): 30%; Term paper (group or individual): 50%.

**Sessions:** Mondays, 1600 to 2000.

**Course Outline:** This unit sets out to introduce students to the field of comparative education studies, its origins in the early 19<sup>th</sup> century, and the variety of orientations, trends and schools that have developed since then. The developments in comparative education approaches and paradigms will be linked to parallel debates in epistemology, research methods, and the social sciences more broadly. Students will in particular be required to focus on such areas as: defining comparison; paradigm shifts in comparative education; the use and abuse of comparative education; ideology in comparative education; and methodological and philosophical considerations in comparative education. Our main concern will be to understand education as a social practice and as a world-wide phenomenon, while focusing on education in Malta from an international perspective. Examples, comparisons and cases are selected from a broad range of countries, with special attention being given to the Mediterranean and European regions.

**Course Learning Outcomes:** By the end of this course, students will be able to address such questions as: ‘What is the purpose of comparison?’ ‘How did comparative education studies begin?’ ‘What were the key debates and issues over time?’ ‘Who were some of the leading figures in comparative education, and what was their respective contribution and legacy?’ ‘What were the main paradigm shifts in the field, and why did these take place?’ ‘Which philosophical currents have had an influence on comparative education?’ ‘What are some of the main pitfalls in comparative education?’ ‘What types of question and evidence provide a legitimate basis for comparison?’ ‘How are the comparative education methods similar to/different from comparative studies in other fields (e.g. sociology, politics, religion, literature, philosophy, economy, social history, cultural studies, cross-cultural psychology)?’ ‘What kind of disciplinary background do comparativists need?’ Students will, in particular, start forming a clear idea about units of comparison (i.e. comparing places, systems, times, cultures, values, educational achievements, policies, educational organisations, ways of learning, and pedagogical innovations).

**Requirements:** The course combines lectures with student-led discussions, participatory activities, and presentations. Students are required to read session specific material in advance, and to be able to critique them in class discussions. In each session, students will be asked to lead a class discussion with a partner or small group. Student sub-groups will be assigned sessions for presentation according to their theme of interest. Each session will have a panel of discussants, but all students are required to actively participate by providing thoughtful, critical and constructive comments. Students are required to submit their final paper on a topic of their choice. The paper should strive to attain the standards associated with journal publications, and should be around 5,000 words in length. References should follow the style indicated in the course Guidebook.

## TEXTBOOKS AND READING ASSIGNMENTS

### A. Books:

#### ***I. General educational theory background:***

*[Recommended reading for all students, and required reading for all those who have not previously followed courses in educational theory].*

Moore, R. (2004) *Education and Society: Issues and Explanations in the Sociology of Education*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Halsey, A.H., Lauder, H., Brown, P. & Wells, A.S. (eds)(1997) *Education: culture, economy and society*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, and

Sultana, R.G. (ed.)(1997) *Inside/outside schools: towards a critical sociology of education in Malta*. Malta: PEG [available at <http://www.um.edu.mt/emcer/courses2/b.ed.hons.>], and

Sultana, R.G. (ed.)(2001) *Yesterday's schools: readings in Maltese educational history*. Malta: PEG, and

Wain, K. (2004) *The learning society in a postmodern world: the education crisis*. New York: Peter Lang.

#### ***II. Textbooks in Comparative Education:***

##### **Key textbook:**

Bray, M., Adamson, B. & Mason, M. (eds)(2007) *Comparative education research: approaches and methods*. Hong Kong: CERC & Springer.

##### **Other useful sources to dip into:**

Altbach, P., Arnove, R. & Kelly, G. (eds)(1992) *Emergent issues in education: comparative perspectives*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

Altbach, P.G. & Kelly, G.P. (eds)(1986) *New approaches to comparative education*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Arnove, R. & Torres, C.A (eds)(2003) *Comparative education: the dialectic of the global and the local*. Lanham, Boulder, New York and Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers Inc.

Bray, M. (ed.)(2003) *Comparative education: continuing traditions, new challenges and new paradigms*. Dordrecht, London, Boston: Kluwer Publishers.

Bray, M. & Packer, S. (1993) *Education in small states: concepts, challenges and strategies*. Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Burns, R. & Welch, A. (eds)(1992) *Contemporary perspectives in comparative education*. New York: Garland Press.

Crossley, M. & Watson, K. (2003) *Globalisation, context and difference*. London & New York: RoutledgeFalmer.

Halls, W.D. (ed.)(1990) *Comparative education: contemporary issues and trends*. London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Lê Thành Khôi (1995) *Education et civilisations*. Paris: Unesco.

Murray Thomas, R. (ed.)(1990) *International comparative education: practices, issues and prospects*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann Ltd.

Noah, A. & Eckstein, M. (1998) *Doing comparative education: three decades of collaboration*. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre [N.B. Free download from <http://www.hku.hk/cerc/Publications/CERC-5.htm>]

Schriewer, J. & Holmes, B. (1988) *Theories and methods in comparative education*. Frankfurt am Main, Bern, New York, Paris: Peter Lang.

Sultana, R.G. (ed.)(2001) *Challenge and change in the Euro-Mediterranean: case studies in educational innovation*. New York: Peter Lang.

## **B. Selected Readings**

[Note: these are suggested readings. Students are encouraged to select from these and to find other readings, focusing on their own interests and research direction]

### **I. Comparative Education: Definitions and Purpose**

- Arnove, R.F. (2002) 'Comparative and International Education Society (CIES) facing the 21<sup>st</sup> century: challenges and contributions'. *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.45(4), pp.447-503.
- Bray, M. (2003) 'Comparative education in the era of globalization: evolution, missions and roles.' *Policy Futures in Education*, Vol.1(2), pp.209-224.
- Broadfoot, P. (2000) 'Comparative education for the 21<sup>st</sup> century: retrospect and prospect.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(3), pp.357-371.
- Cook, B.J., Hite, S.J. & Epstein, E.H. (2004) 'Discerning trends, contours, boundaries in comparative education: a survey of comparativists and their literature.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.48(2), pp.123-149.
- Cowen, R. (2000) 'Comparing futures or comparing pasts?' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(3), pp.333-342.
- Crossley, M. (1999) 'Reconceptualising comparative and international education.' *Compare*, Vol.29(3), pp.249-267.
- Crossley, M. (2000) 'Bridging cultures and traditions in the reconceptualisation of comparative and international education.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(3), pp.319-332.
- Crossley, M. (2002) 'Comparative and international education: contemporary challenges, reconceptualisation and new directions for the field.' *Current Issues in Comparative Education*, Vol.4(2), pp.1-6.
- Grant, N. (2000) 'Tasks for comparative education in the new millennium.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(3), pp.309-317.
- Latiner Raby, R. (2004) 'State of the field: a critical essay on the 2003 *Comparative Education Review* bibliography.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.48(4), pp.470-475.
- Marginson, S. & Mollis, M. (2002) 'The door opens and the tiger leaps': theories and reflexivities of comparative education for a global millennium.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.45(4), pp.581-615.
- Noah, A. & Eckstein, M. (1998) *Doing Comparative Education: Three Decades of Collaboration*. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre: Part I, pp.13-106. [also available at: <http://www.hku.hk/cerc/Publications/CERC-5.htm>]
- Novoa, A. & Yariv-Mashal, T. (2003) 'Comparative research in education: a mode of governance or a historical journey?' *Comparative Education*, Vol.39(4), pp.423-438.
- Paulston, R. (2000) 'Imagining comparative education: past, present, future.' *Compare*, Vol.30(3), pp.353-367.
- Paulston, R. (1999) 'Mapping comparative education after postmodernity.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.43(4), pp.438-463.
- Thiesen, G. (1997) 'The new ABCs of comparative and international education.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.41(4), pp.397-412.
- Watson, K. (1998) 'Memories, models and mapping: the impact of geopolitical changes on comparative education studies.' *Compare*, Vol.28(1), pp.
- Watson, K. (1999) 'Comparative educational research: the need for reconceptualisation and fresh insights.' *Compare*, Vol.29(3), pp.233-248.

Welch, A.R. (2001) 'Globalisation, post-modernity and the state: comparative education facing the third millennium.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.37(4), pp.475-492.

## **II. Comparative Education: History, Development and Protagonists**

- Broadfoot, M. (2002) 'Obituary: Edmund King.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.38(2), pp.131-132.
- Camilleri, J.J. (2001) 'Paolo Pullicino's educational legacy.' In R.G. Sultana (ed.) *Yesterday's schools: readings in Maltese educational history*. Malta: PEG. [pp.101-122]
- Higginson, J.H. (1999) 'The development of a discipline: some reflections on the development of comparative education as seen through the pages of *Compare*.' *Compare*, Vol.29(3), pp.341-350.
- Higginson, J.H. (1994) 'Michael Ernest Sadler.' *Prospects*, Vol.24(3/4), pp.455-469.
- Kazamias, A. (2001) 'Re-inventing the historical in comparative education: reflections on a *protean episteme* by a contemporary player.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.37(4), pp.439-449.
- King, E. (2000) 'A century of evolution in comparative studies.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(3), pp.267-277.
- King, E. (2000) 'Nigel Grant's contribution to comparative education.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(2), pp.129-133.
- Little, A. (2000) 'Development studies and comparative education: context, content, comparison and contributors.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(3), pp.279-296.
- Mitter, W. (1997) 'Challenges to comparative education: between retrospect and expectation.' *International Review of Education*, Vol. 43(5/6), pp.401-412.
- Noah, A. & Eckstein, M. (1998) 'Toward a science of comparative education.' In A. Noah and M. Eckstein *Doing Comparative Education: Three Decades of Collaboration*. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre: Part I, pp.15-31. [also available at: <http://www.hku.hk/cerc/Publications/CERC-5.htm>]
- Pollack, E. (1993) 'Isaac Leon Kandel.' *Prospects*, Vol.23(3/4), pp.775-787.
- Sutherland, M. (2002) 'Edmund J. King (1914-2002): an international tribute.' *Compare*, Vol.32(3), pp.275-279.

## **III. Comparative Education and its Philosophical Foundations**

- Bu, L. (1997) 'International activism and comparative education: pioneering efforts of the International Institute of Teachers' College, Columbia University.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.41(4), pp.413-434.
- Cowen, R. (2003) 'Agendas of attention: a response to Ninnes and Burnett.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.29(3), pp.299-302.
- Epstein, E.H. (1986) 'Currents Left and Right: Ideology in comparative education.' In P.G. Altbach & G.P. Kelly (eds) *New Approaches to Comparative Education*. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, pp.233-260.
- Hayhoe, R. (2000) 'Redeeming modernity.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.44(4), pp.423-439.
- Holmes, B. (1984) 'Paradigm shifts in comparative education.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.28, pp.584-604.
- Mehta, S. & Ninnes, P. (2003) 'Postmodernism debates and comparative education: a critical discourse analysis.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.47(2), pp.238-255.
- Ninnes, P. & Burnett, G. (2003) 'Comparative education research: poststructuralist possibilities.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.39(3), pp.279-297. Welch, A. (2003) 'The discourse of discourse analysis: a response to Ninnes and Burnett.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.39(3), pp.303-306;

Dale, R. (2003) 'Positive poststructuralism? A Response to Ninnes and Burnett.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.39(3), pp.307-309.

Raivola, R. (1986) 'What is comparison? Methodological and philosophical considerations.' In P.G. Altbach & G.P. Kelly (eds) *New Approaches to Comparative Education*. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, pp.261-274.

#### **IV. Comparative Education Methodology**

The following chapters from M. Bray, B. Adamson & M. Mason (eds)(2007) *Comparative Education Research: Approaches and Methods* (Hong Kong: CERC & Dordrecht: Springer):

Fairbrother, G.P. (2007) 'Quantitative and qualitative approaches to comparative education.' (Chapter 2).

Manzon, M. (2007) 'Comparing places.' (Chapter 4).

Bray, M. & Kai, J. (2007) 'Comparing systems.' (Chapter 5).

Sweeting, A. (2007) 'Comparing times.' (Chapter 6).

Mason, M. (2007) 'Comparing cultures.' (Chapter 7).

Wing-On, L. (2007) 'Comparing values.' (Chapter 8).

Postlethwaite, T.N. & Leung, F. (2007) 'Comparing educational achievements.' (Chapter 9).

Rui, Y. (2007) 'Comparing policies.' (Chapter 10).

Adamson, B. & Morris, P. (2007) 'Comparing curricula.' (Chapter 11).

Dimmock, C. (2007) 'Comparing educational organisations.' (Chapter 12).

Watkins, D.A. (2007) 'Comparing ways of learning.' (Chapter 13).

Law, N. (2007) 'Comparing pedagogical innovation.' (Chapter 14).

#### **V. Comparative Education and its Contexts**

Anderson-Levitt, K. (2004) 'Reading lessons in Guinea, France and the United States: local meanings or global culture?' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.48(3), pp.229-252.

Apple, M. (2001) 'Comparing neo-liberal projects and inequality in education.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.37(4), pp.409-423.

Bray, M. & Murray Thomas, R. (1995) 'Levels of comparison in educational studies: different insights from different literatures and the value of multilevel analyses.' *Harvard Educational Review*, Vol.65(3), pp.472-490.

Hawkins, J.N. & Rust, V.D. (2001) 'Shifting perspectives on comparative research: a view from the USA.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.37(4), pp.501-506.

Noah, A. & Eckstein, M. (1998) *Doing comparative education: three decades of collaboration*. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre: Part II, pp.107-176. [Also available at: <http://www.hku.hk/cerc/Publications/CERC-5.htm> ]

Sueyo, H. (2003) 'Educational biography of an Arakmbut.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.39(2), pp.193-197.

Torres, C.A. (2002) 'Comparative education: requiem for liberalism?' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.46(4), pp.iii-xi.

Wolhuter, C.C. (1997) 'Classification of national education systems: a multivariate approach.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.41(2), pp.161-177.

#### **VI. Pitfalls in Comparative Education**

Noah, A. & Eckstein, M. (1998) 'Use and abuse of comparative education.' Chapter 7 of *Doing comparative education: three decades of collaboration*. Hong Kong: Comparative Education

Research Centre: pp.57-67. [Also available at: <http://www.hku.hk/cerc/Publications/CERC-5.htm> ]

- Phillips, D. (2000) 'Learning form elsewhere in education: some perennial problems revisited with reference to British interest in Germany.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(3), pp.297-307.
- Phillips, D. & Ochs, K. (2003) 'Processes of policy borrowing in education: some explanatory and analytical devices.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.39(4), pp.451-461.
- Phillips, D. & Ochs, K. (2004) 'Researching policy borrowing: some methodological challenges in comparative education.' *British Educational Research*, Vol.30(6), pp.774-784.
- Schleischer, A. (1995) 'Comparability issues in international educational comparisons.' In W. Bos & R.H. Lehmann (eds) *Reflections on educational achievement: papers in honour of T. Neville Postlethwaite*. [Also open access to whole book: <http://www.waxmann.com/index2.html?kat/310.html> ]

### **VII. Examples of Comparative Education**

- Bagnall, F. (2000) 'The balance between vocational secondary and general secondary schooling in France and Australia.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(4), pp.459-475.
- Broadfoot, P. & Little, A. (2003) Review symposium on Robin Alexander's *Culture and Pedagogy: International Comparisons in Primary Education*. *Comparative Education*, Vol.39(1), pp.119-126.
- Boli, J.; Ramirez, F.O. & Mejer, J.W. (1986) 'Explaining the origins and expansion of mass education.' In P.G. Altbach & G.P. Kelly (eds) *New approaches to comparative education*. Chicago & London: University of Chicago Press, pp.105-130.
- Bruhn, J. (1995) 'Mathematics education and comparative studies: two examples.' In W. Bos & R.H. Lehmann (eds) *Reflections on educational achievement: papers in honour of T. Neville Postlethwaite*. Free access to whole book: <http://www.waxmann.com/index2.html?kat/310.html>
- Clayton, T. (1998) 'Beyond mystification: reconnecting world-system theory for comparative education.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.42(4), pp.479-496.
- Gorard, S. (2001) 'International comparisons of school effectiveness: the second component of the 'crisis account' in England?' *Comparative Education*, Vol.37(2), pp.279-296.
- Gorard, S. & Smith, E. (2004) 'An international comparison of equity in education systems.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.40(1), pp.15-28.
- Green, A.; Preston, J. & Sabates, R. (2003) 'Education, equality and social cohesion: a distributional approach.' *Compare*, Vol.33(4), pp.453-470.
- Jónasson, J.T. (2003) 'Does the state expand schooling? A study based on five Nordic countries.' *Comparative Education Review*, Vol.47(2), pp.160-183.
- Lassibille, G. & Navarro Gomez, L. (2000) 'Organisation and efficiency of educational systems: some empirical findings.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.36(1), pp.7-19.
- Lewis, R.; Romo, S.; Qui, X. & Kaatz, Y.J. (2005) 'Teachers' classroom discipline and student misbehaviour in Australia, China and Israel.' *Teaching and Teacher Education*, Vol.21, pp.729-745.
- Livingstone, R. (1999) 'Lifelong learning and underemployment in the knowledge society: a North American perspective.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.35(2), pp.163-186.
- Osborn, M. (2001) 'Constants and contexts in pupil experience of learning and schooling: comparing learners in England, France and Denmark.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.37(3), pp.267-278.
- Sultana, R.G. (1992) *Education and national development: historical and critical perspectives on vocational schooling in Malta*. Msida: Mireva.

- Torres, C.A. (2002) 'The state, privatization and educational policy: a critique of neo-liberalism in Latin America: some ethical and political implications.' *Comparative Education*, Vol.38(4), pp.365-385.
- Turner, D. (2005) 'Benchmarking in universities: league tables revisited.' *Oxford Review of Education*, Vol.31(3), pp.353-371.