

# ENGLISH AS A SECOND LANGUAGE: THE NEW SEGREGATION

*Krystina Yackle\**

## I. INTRODUCTION

In *Brown v. Board of Education*, the Supreme Court decided that there was no place in education for separate but equal educational facilities.<sup>1</sup> Ultimately, these facilities, due to segregation by race, were inherently unequal and deprived students of the equal protection of the laws provided by the Fourteenth Amendment.<sup>2</sup> Even though segregation of races by school has been declared unconstitutional, there is still a form of segregation happening within schools today through the use of English as a Second Language (ESL) programs.<sup>3</sup> Students identified as English Language Learners (ELLs) are placed into classrooms away from fluent English speakers, creating a new form of segregation by native language.<sup>4</sup> The group most affected by this linguistic segregation are those who speak Spanish at home.<sup>5</sup> Ultimately, the effect that this separation has is an unequal educational opportunity.<sup>6</sup> This has a severe negative impact on the academic achievement of these Spanish-speaking ELL students.<sup>7</sup> Instead of using ESL programs to isolate native Spanish speakers and deny them the equal education opportunities of their English-speaking counterparts, schools should consider adopting two-way dual language

---

\*J.D. Candidate, May 2018, Loyola University School of Law.

<sup>1</sup> *Brown v. Bd. of Educ.*, 247 U.S. 483, 495 (1954).

<sup>2</sup> *Id.*

<sup>3</sup> M. Beatriz Arias, *PICS: The Education Implications of Linguistic Isolation and Segregation of Latino English Language Learners (ELLs)*, The Civil Rights Project (June 28, 2007), <https://civilrightsproject.ucla.edu/legal-developments/court-decisions/the-educational-implications-of-linguistic-isolation-and-segregation-of-latino-english-language-learners-ells>.

<sup>4</sup> *Id.*

<sup>5</sup> *Id.*

<sup>6</sup> *Id.*

<sup>7</sup> Janie T. Carnock, *The "Triple Segregation" of Latinos, ELLs: What Can We Do?*, New America Ed Central (Nov. 17, 2015), <http://www.edcentral.org/latinos-segregation/>.

immersion programs.<sup>8</sup> Through the use of dual-language immersion programs, schools can work to end this new form of linguistic segregation through voluntary integration, decrease the achievement gap between English speaking students and ELLs, and support long-term academic achievement of both ELLs and native-English speakers.

## II. LINGUISTIC SEGREGATION

In the United States, the number of students entering public schools who are English language learners (ELL) has been steadily increasing over the last century, with over 4.4 million ELL students enrolled as of the 2012-2013 school year (or roughly 9.2% of all students).<sup>9</sup> A 2013 survey performed by the U.S. Census Bureau found that 71% of ELL students are native Spanish speakers.<sup>10</sup> As a result of this ever-increasing population, the United States Congress passed the Equal Educational Opportunities Act (EEOA) in 1974 to try and protect these students' educational interests.<sup>11</sup> This Act directs States to "take appropriate action to overcome language barriers that impede equal participation by its students in its instructional programs," but does not specify what actions qualify as appropriate.<sup>12</sup>

As a result, many schools have adopted ESL pull-out programs.<sup>13</sup> These are the most common programs for ELLs, but they are not bilingual and do not offer instruction in the

---

<sup>8</sup> *Id.*

<sup>9</sup> *English Language Learners*, National Center for Education Statistics (May 2015), [http://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/indicator\\_cgf.asp](http://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/indicator_cgf.asp).

<sup>10</sup> Ariel G. Ruiz Soto, Sarah Hooker, & Jeanne Batalova, *Top Languages Spoken by English Language Learners*, Migration Policy Institute (Nov. 4, 2015), <http://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/top-languages-spoken-english-language-learners-nationally-and-state>.

<sup>11</sup> Michelle R. Wood, Note, *ESL and Bilingual Education as a Proxy for Racial and Ethnic Segregation in U.S. Public Schools*, 11 *J. Gender Race & Just.* 599, 607 (2008).

<sup>12</sup> *Id.*

<sup>13</sup> Virginia P. Collier & Wayne P. Thomas, *The Astounding Effectiveness of Dual Language Education for All*, 2 *NABE J. Res. & Prac.* 1, 2 (2004), [http://www.berkeleyschools.net/wp-content/uploads/2011/10/TWIAstounding\\_Effectiveness\\_Dual\\_Language\\_Ed.pdf?864d7e](http://www.berkeleyschools.net/wp-content/uploads/2011/10/TWIAstounding_Effectiveness_Dual_Language_Ed.pdf?864d7e).

student's native language.<sup>14</sup> These programs are designed to remove non-English speaking students into separate classrooms from their English-speaking counterparts and expose them to intensive-English instruction.<sup>15</sup> For example, in some schools in Arizona, students are required to attend four-hour long English Language Development (EDL) classes daily, which means that they are spending roughly half of their school day away from native English speaking students.<sup>16</sup>

The reasons behind these ESL programs is the belief that this separation is actually beneficial to ELLs.<sup>17</sup> It is thought that this method provides Spanish speakers with a safe environment to practice their linguistic skills instead of leaving them to struggle in an English-only classroom.<sup>18</sup> While the purpose of these programs is to help these students learn English faster so that they can transition into regular mainstream classes with their peers, the effect is that it keeps them physically and socially separated from the rest of the students.<sup>19</sup> Furthermore, since a large majority of native Spanish speakers only speak Spanish at home and within their communities, there is very little opportunity for them to interact with English speakers outside of school.<sup>20</sup> By keeping them in separate classrooms, schools are perpetuating a larger linguistic isolation that is occurring in society as a result of language barriers.<sup>21</sup> Since language learning is essentially a social process, interaction is a vital part of successful language acquisition, and this separation can actually decelerate the language acquisition process.<sup>22</sup> Therefore, if ELLs are not

---

<sup>14</sup> Virginia P. Collier & Wayne P. Thomas, *Reforming Education Policies for English Learners*, 3 St. Educ. Standard 31, 32 (2002).

<sup>15</sup> Beatriz Arias & Christian Faltis, *Coming Out of the ESL Ghetto: Promising Practice for Latino Immigrant Students and English Learners in Hypersegregated Secondary Schools*, 6 J. of Border Educ. Res. 19, 22 (2007).

<sup>16</sup> Carnock, *supra* note 7.

<sup>17</sup> *Id.*

<sup>18</sup> Weronika Lass, *ESL Pull-out projects vs. Total Immersion – Which Language Learning Method is More Effective?*, The Online Encyclopedia of Writing Systems & Languages, <http://www.omniglot.com/language/articles/pulloutvimmersion.htm>.

<sup>19</sup> *Id.*

<sup>20</sup> Beatriz Arias, *School Desegregation, Linguistic Segregation and Access to English for Latino Students*, 2 J. Educ. Controversy 1, 9 (2007), <http://cedar.wvu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1034&context=jec>.

<sup>21</sup> *Id.*

<sup>22</sup> *Id.*

exposed to the social elements of the English language, they are not learning to communicate in a school setting, or how to use English in culturally appropriate ways.<sup>23</sup> Unfortunately, since the future of these students is dependent on proficiency in English, this linguistic segregation can have serious consequences on their academic and future successes.<sup>24</sup>

### III. THE ACHIEVEMENT GAP

National data shows that there is an achievement gap between native English speakers and ELLs in the United States.<sup>25</sup> When students are forced to spend extended blocks of time learning English in a separate classroom from their peers, they often miss out on other academic content such as math, science, and social studies.<sup>26</sup> An assessment by the National Center for Educational Statistics showed that while there was an increase in average reading and math scores by ELLs from 2002-2011, there is still a large achievement gap between ELLs and non-ELLs.<sup>27</sup> The assessment shows that in 2011, the achievement gap between non-ELL and ELL students was 36 points at the 4<sup>th</sup>-grade level, and 44 points at the 8<sup>th</sup>-grade level (based on average scores taken from both groups).<sup>28</sup> Furthermore, a 2005 assessment showed that 46% of 4<sup>th</sup> grade ELL students and 71% of 8<sup>th</sup> grade ELL students scored in the lowest category for math (compared to only 11% and 21% for 4<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade white students).<sup>29</sup> In Reading, 73% of 4<sup>th</sup> grade ELLs and 71% of 8<sup>th</sup> grade ELLs scored in the lowest category for reading (compared to only 25% and 19% for 4<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> grade white students).<sup>30</sup>

---

<sup>23</sup> Arias, *supra* note 3.

<sup>24</sup> Richard Fry, *How Far Behind in Math and Reading are English Language Learners?*, Pew Research Center: Hispanic Trends (June 6, 2007), <http://www.pewhispanic.org/2007/06/06/iii-national-ell-achievement-gaps/>.

<sup>25</sup> *Id.*

<sup>26</sup> Carnock, *supra* note 7.

<sup>27</sup> *English Language Learners*, National Center for Education Statistics (May 2015), [https://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/pdf/Indicator\\_CGF/COE\\_CGF\\_2013\\_05.pdf](https://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/pdf/Indicator_CGF/COE_CGF_2013_05.pdf).

<sup>28</sup> *Id.*

<sup>29</sup> Fry, *supra* note 24.

<sup>30</sup> *Id.*

**Table 1**  
National Performance in Mathematics and Reading  
*(percent of students in achievement level)*

Achievement Level	MATH		READING	
	Grade 4	Grade 8	Grade 4	Grade 8
<b>ELL Students</b>				
Advanced	1	1	1	0
Proficient	11	5	6	4
Basic	43	23	21	24
Below Basic	46	71	73	71
<b>White Students</b>				
Advanced	7	7	10	3
Proficient	40	30	30	34
Basic	42	42	35	43
Below Basic	11	21	25	19

31

These achievement gaps begin as early as first grade, evidenced by a one-year reading gap between ELLs and non-ELLs.<sup>32</sup> This only increases as the children pass on to higher grades, resulting in a large high school graduation gap between ELLs and non-ELLs.<sup>33</sup>

The average non-ELL student gains about ten months of academic growth in English development in one ten-month school year.<sup>34</sup> They also make this amount of progress in other subject areas such as math, science, and social studies.<sup>35</sup> Conversely, ELL students initially score three or more years behind their non-ELL peers, which leaves them at a large deficit from the very beginning of their education.<sup>36</sup>

---

<sup>31</sup> *Id.*

<sup>32</sup> Melissa Lazarin, *Enabling Success for English Language Learners*, Stand for Children Leadership Center (June 2012), [https://standleadershipcenter.org/sites/standleadershipcenter.org/files/media/WWSF-ELL\\_0.pdf](https://standleadershipcenter.org/sites/standleadershipcenter.org/files/media/WWSF-ELL_0.pdf).

<sup>33</sup> *Id.*

<sup>34</sup> Virginia P. Collier & Wayne P. Thomas, *Two Languages Are Better Than One*, 55 *Educ. Leadership* 23, 26 (1997).

<sup>35</sup> *Id.*

<sup>36</sup> *Id.*

Part of the achievement gap stems directly from the ESL program.<sup>37</sup> The proficiency level required in English in order to perform similarly to non-ELL students takes four to seven years to reach.<sup>38</sup> This is because most academic knowledge and material employs academic English, which differs from conversational English.<sup>39</sup> Because it involves the use of language not typically heard in everyday conversation, ELLs must spend time learning a more difficult form of English before they are even able to successfully comprehend higher-level academic content.<sup>40</sup> Therefore, while these students are learning English, they are not being exposed to challenging coursework.<sup>41</sup> When ELLs are judged to not be proficient in English, they are then viewed as remedial students, and are given less access to standard grade-level material.<sup>42</sup>

Another issue is that many ELLs attend lower-quality schools.<sup>43</sup> Most of the Spanish-speaking ELL students are in a lower socio-economic group.<sup>44</sup> The effect of attending a poor-quality schools is that ELL students may take longer to become English-fluent.<sup>45</sup> Students who do not become fluent in English by secondary school are more likely to end up in lower-level, less rigorous classes.<sup>46</sup> This decreases their chances of graduating high school or attending college.<sup>47</sup> In other words, ESL programs put ELL students in a position to overcome two challenges: learning English and accessing challenging coursework that will allow them to stay

---

<sup>37</sup> Lazarin, *supra* note 32.

<sup>38</sup> *Id.*

<sup>39</sup> *Id.*

<sup>40</sup> *Id.*

<sup>41</sup> *Id.*

<sup>42</sup> Collier, *supra* note 14.

<sup>43</sup> Lazarin, *supra* note 32.

<sup>44</sup> Carnock, *supra* note 7.

<sup>45</sup> Lazarin, *supra* note 32.

<sup>46</sup> *Id.*

<sup>47</sup> *Id.*

on track with their non-ELL peers.<sup>48</sup> This is a clearly imbalanced and unequal education system that disadvantages ELL students.

#### IV. TWO-WAY DUAL LANGUAGE IMMERSION PROGRAMS

A possible solution to this segregation and achievement gap is for school districts to establish dual-language immersion programs.<sup>49</sup> When it comes to language programs available for ELLs, there are several varieties.<sup>50</sup> One type of program is the two-way immersion program (TWI).<sup>51</sup> A TWI involves placing English speakers and Spanish speakers in the same classroom, with instruction given in both languages.<sup>52</sup> There are two models for a TWI program: a 90-10 model and a 50-50 model.<sup>53</sup> The 90-10 model involves Spanish being used 90% of the time in early grades.<sup>54</sup> Then a gradual increase in English instruction occurs in subsequent grades until sixth grade, where both languages are used equally.<sup>55</sup> The 50-50 model, on the other hand, involves instruction in each language equally from the start.<sup>56</sup> The program is designed so that the focus is on the core academic curriculum (unlike the watered-down curriculum of ESL programs).<sup>57</sup>

The structure of the program allows non-ELLs to learn a second language, ELLs to learn English, and for both groups to be given equal opportunities at academic achievement and growth.<sup>58</sup> Essentially, the native-English speakers become peer tutors to the ELLs and vice-

---

<sup>48</sup> *Id.*

<sup>49</sup> Carnock, *supra* note 7.

<sup>50</sup> Collier, *supra* note 13.

<sup>51</sup> *Id.*

<sup>52</sup> *Id.*

<sup>53</sup> Leo Gomez, David Freeman & Yvonne Freeman, *Dual Language Education: A Promising 50-50 Model*, 29 *Bilingual Res. J.* 145, 148 (2010).

<sup>54</sup> *Id.*

<sup>55</sup> *Id.*

<sup>56</sup> *Id.*

<sup>57</sup> Collier, *supra* note 14, at 33.

<sup>58</sup> Gomez, *supra* note 53.

versa.<sup>59</sup> Students are, therefore, not wasting valuable time in school hyper-focusing on learning English, and can actually focus on grade-level tasks and academic lessons.<sup>60</sup>

A study by the Houston Education Research Consortium found that ELLs in TWI programs had the best Spanish as well as English skills as compared to ELLs involved in other programs.<sup>61</sup> This study shows that Spanish speakers benefit from an exposure to native English speakers.<sup>62</sup> These programs also take into account the students' culture, and not just their language background, in order to instill success.<sup>63</sup> The idea is that in order for the instruction to be meaningful, it must reflect the children's cultural experiences and build upon their competencies.<sup>64</sup> The atmosphere of these programs in inclusiveness, integration, and unification among students of different cultures and language backgrounds.<sup>65</sup>

While common ESL programs are often viewed as remedial in nature, TWI programs are seen as enrichment programs where students are adding a bilingual element to their regular education.<sup>66</sup> Students are merely adding a second language instead of replacing their native language.<sup>67</sup> This creates a more positive mindset surrounding programs involving ELLs, and helps to alleviate the false inferiority and concept that ELLs are broken and in need of fixing.<sup>68</sup>

---

<sup>59</sup> Collier, *supra* note 14, at 33.

<sup>60</sup> *Id.*

<sup>61</sup> Ryan Holeywell, *New Study Shows Benefits of Two-Way, Dual-Language Education*, Rice Kinder Institute for Urban Research (June 3, 2015), <https://kinder.rice.edu/blog/holeywell060315/>.

<sup>62</sup> *Id.*

<sup>63</sup> Natalie A. Tran, Sam Behseta, Mark Ellis, Armando Martinez-Cruz, & Jacqueline Contreras, *The Effect of Spanish English Dual Language Immersion on Student Achievement in Science and Mathematics*, eJournal of Education Policy (2015), [http://nau.edu/COE/eJournal/\\_Forms/speciss2015/Tran\\_et\\_al/](http://nau.edu/COE/eJournal/_Forms/speciss2015/Tran_et_al/).

<sup>64</sup> *Id.*

<sup>65</sup> Holeywell, *supra* note 61.

<sup>66</sup> Ester de Jong & Elizabeth Howard, *Integration in Two-Way Immersion Education: Equalising Linguistic Benefits for All Students*, 12 Int'l J. Bilingual Educ. & Bilingualism 81, 84 (2009).

<sup>67</sup> *Id.*

<sup>68</sup> Virginia P. Collier & Wayne P. Thomas, *The Multiple Benefits of Dual Language*, 61 Educ. Leadership 61, 62 (2003).



## V. BENEFITS FOR ELLS

Some of the pitfalls of ESL programs is that they place an emphasis on learning English quickly, which can lead to difficulties learning other subject areas, as well as a loss of cultural connection that is attached to one's native tongue.<sup>69</sup> Because of the focus on learning English in ESL programs, students are offered remedial, watered-down instruction, which does not allow them to perform at the same level as native English speakers.<sup>70</sup> TWI programs, on the other hand, allow ELL students to do academic work in their native language as well as in English.<sup>71</sup> Through this arrangement, these students have been able to close the achievement gap which is measured through English tests across the curriculum, showing a deep knowledge of academic subjects in both languages and achieving on or above grade level.<sup>72</sup> A longitudinal study performed at the Stanford University Graduate School of Education analyzed the academic progression of students from kindergarten through middle school in English language arts (ELA) and math.<sup>73</sup> The researchers compared scores of ELLs in fully English-immersive programs, Transitional Bilingual programs, Developmental Bilingual programs, and Dual Immersion programs.<sup>74</sup> What the study ultimately showed was that ELL students in fully-immersive English-only programs scored higher than their dual-language peers in the short run.<sup>75</sup> However, over the longer-term, ELL students in dual-language programs have much higher ELA and math scores than their peers in English-only programs.<sup>76</sup> Even more importantly, the ELLs in dual

---

<sup>69</sup> De Jong, *supra* note 66.

<sup>70</sup> *Id.*

<sup>71</sup> Collier, *supra* note 34.

<sup>72</sup> *Id.*

<sup>73</sup> Rachel A. Valentino & Sean F. Reardon, *Effectiveness of Four Instructional Programs Designed to Serve English Learners: Variation by Ethnicity and Initial English Proficiency*, Stanford Center for Education Policy Analysis (Dec. 2014), [http://cepa.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/Valentino\\_Reardon\\_EL%20Programs\\_12\\_15\\_14.pdf](http://cepa.stanford.edu/sites/default/files/Valentino_Reardon_EL%20Programs_12_15_14.pdf).

<sup>74</sup> *Id.*

<sup>75</sup> *Id.*

<sup>76</sup> *Id.*

immersion programs greatly out-pace their ELL peers in other types of programs.<sup>77</sup> The researchers note some possibilities for this outcome.<sup>78</sup> First, ELLs in dual-language immersion programs are exposed to native English-speaking peers, which exposes them to a strong model of English language use.<sup>79</sup> Second, and more importantly, because the program uses their native language in conjunction with English, these students do not fall behind in core academic subjects due to a lack of understanding caused by a language barrier.<sup>80</sup> Furthermore, studies have shown that children are better able to transfer language skills from one language to the other if they continue development in their native language.<sup>81</sup>

To further support this, other studies performed in Texas and Maine public schools looked at how ELL students performed from kindergarten through twelfth grade.<sup>82</sup> The analysis showed that both one-way and two-way bilingual programs lead to grade-level and above-grade-level achievement, making these the only programs for ELLs that successfully close the achievement gap.<sup>83</sup> However, ELLs in the one-way bilingual programs typically do not reach grade level achievement until 7<sup>th</sup> or 8<sup>th</sup> grade and maintain slightly above grade level for the remainder of their schooling.<sup>84</sup> ELLs in the TWI programs, though, reach achievement by 5<sup>th</sup> or 6<sup>th</sup> grade, and then continue to accelerate to as high as the 70<sup>th</sup> percentile by 11<sup>th</sup> grade.<sup>85</sup> The researchers note how remarkable this growth is since it is even greater than that of the native-

---

<sup>77</sup> *Id.*

<sup>78</sup> *Id.*

<sup>79</sup> *Id.*

<sup>80</sup> *Id.*

<sup>81</sup> *Id.*

<sup>82</sup> Collier, *supra* note 13, at 11.

<sup>83</sup> *Id.*

<sup>84</sup> *Id.*

<sup>85</sup> *Id.*

English speakers being schooled in their own language with all the cognitive, academic, and sociocultural advantages that ELLs simply do not have.<sup>86</sup>

The inclusive nature of TWI programs allows ELL students to be part of the same world as their non-minority peers, as opposed to the segregated and divisive world that ESL programs create.<sup>87</sup> By placing the two groups together, students develop positive intergroup relationships, breaking down stereotypes and developing positive attitudes towards both languages and language groups.<sup>88</sup> The use of these programs has also brought more harmony to certain communities by building cross-cultural school communities and friendships not only between students, but also parents.<sup>89</sup> These relationships are far less likely to exist outside of this context.<sup>90</sup> Also, because ELLs are placed with non-ELLs, there is more incentive to use English for social and academic purposes as their interactions become more authentic and meaningful.<sup>91</sup> This allows them more opportunity to practice, which is something that is difficult for ELLs that are separated in ESL programs.<sup>92</sup> Plus, even though these students are learning about American culture and learning English, they are still developing their own native language and do not have to sacrifice their cultural identities.<sup>93</sup> What makes TWI programs different from other programs is that they do not erase the ELLs appreciation of their own language and culture.<sup>94</sup>

---

<sup>86</sup> *Id.*

<sup>87</sup> Collier, *supra* note 68, at 63.

<sup>88</sup> De Jong, *supra* note 66, at 85.

<sup>89</sup> Gomez, *supra* note 53, at 146.

<sup>90</sup> *Id.*

<sup>91</sup> De Jong, *supra* note 66, at 85.

<sup>92</sup> *Id.*

<sup>93</sup> Illiana Alanis & Mariela A. Rodriguez, *Sustaining a Dual Language Immersion Program: Features of Success*, 7 *J. Latinos & Educ.* 305, 306 (2008).

<sup>94</sup> *Id.*

In order to implement these programs, some districts are able to bring mainstream children into minority-heavy schools.<sup>95</sup> By doing this, low-income schools become exposed to middle-class orientation, which offers more resources for school facilities, teaching staff, materials and supplies, and access to technology.<sup>96</sup> These factors have been shown to help improve the educational experience and allow for greater success of students.<sup>97</sup>

Another benefit for ELL students is that by high school, students involved in TWI programs reported having more confidence and feeling more valued.<sup>98</sup> Latino students in particular expressed this feeling more than other ELL students coming from other language backgrounds.<sup>99</sup>

## **VI. BENEFITS FOR NATIVE-ENGLISH SPEAKERS**

For non-ELL students, there are many benefits to becoming bilingual.<sup>100</sup> Cognitive neuroscientist, Ellen Bialystok, spent 40 years learning about the ways that being bilingual affect the brain.<sup>101</sup> Her studies led her to conclude that bilingual children are able to focus on and recognize important information much more quickly and easily than monolingual children.<sup>102</sup> These same thinking patterns and abilities were apparent in bilingual adults.<sup>103</sup> An explanation for this is that bilinguals must switch languages often in different situations, so they develop deeper cognitive skills.<sup>104</sup> However, in order to reap these benefits, both languages have to be

---

<sup>95</sup> Guadalupe Valdes, *Dual-Language Immersion Programs: A Cautionary Note Concerning the Education of Language-Minority Students*, 67 Harv. Educ. Rev. 391, 412 (1997).

<sup>96</sup> *Id.*

<sup>97</sup> *Id.*

<sup>98</sup> Kathryn J. Lindholm-Leary, *The Rich Promise of Two-Way Immersion*, Educ. Leadership (Dec 2004), [http://www.lindholm-leary.com/articles/EducLeadership\\_TWI2.pdf](http://www.lindholm-leary.com/articles/EducLeadership_TWI2.pdf).

<sup>99</sup> *Id.*

<sup>100</sup> Claudia Dreifus, *The Bilingual Advantage*, N.Y. Times (May 30, 2011), [http://www.nytimes.com/2011/05/31/science/31conversation.html?\\_r=0](http://www.nytimes.com/2011/05/31/science/31conversation.html?_r=0).

<sup>101</sup> *Id.*

<sup>102</sup> *Id.*

<sup>103</sup> *Id.*

<sup>104</sup> *Id.*

used frequently, which means that the current American system of only exposing students to language for limited periods in high school is not effective in developing these skills.<sup>105</sup>

By participating in a TWI program, native English speakers are able to develop proficiency in a second language, but do not sacrifice development on their native language nor on academic achievement.<sup>106</sup> In fact, the non-ELLs involved in TWI programs end up scoring higher in English than their non-ELL peers in English-only programs.<sup>107</sup> In a study which analyzed TWI students' performances from 3<sup>rd</sup> through 5<sup>th</sup> grade, English speaking students in TWI programs also outperformed their peers in English-only classrooms in math in all three grades.<sup>108</sup> In a study in Houston, native English speakers that had been in a TWI program for four years were tested in reading, and had scores in the 63<sup>rd</sup> to 70<sup>th</sup> percentile.<sup>109</sup> The scores of their native English speaking peers in English-only classrooms were only around the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile.<sup>110</sup>

There are also cultural benefits to participating in a TWI program.<sup>111</sup> Because of the integrated nature of the program, English speakers are exposed to different worldviews of their culturally diverse peers.<sup>112</sup> They gain knowledge and respect for these new customs.<sup>113</sup> Furthermore, they gain a second language that can be used socially and professionally throughout their lives.<sup>114</sup> Plus, much like their ELL peers, native English speaking students are

---

<sup>105</sup> *Id.*

<sup>106</sup> Rebecca Klein, *Schools Are Incredibly Segregated, But Teaching Two Languages Could Help*, Huffington Post (Dec. 16, 2015), [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/dual-language-school-desegregation\\_us\\_564cc274e4b031745cef329a](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/dual-language-school-desegregation_us_564cc274e4b031745cef329a).

<sup>107</sup> Gomez, *supra* note 53, at 146.

<sup>108</sup> Viorica Marian, Anthony Shook, & Scott R. Schroeder, *Bilingual Two-Way Immersion Programs Benefit Academic Achievement*, 36 *Bilingual Res. J.* 167, 176 (2013).

<sup>109</sup> Collier, *supra* note 68, at 64.

<sup>110</sup> *Id.*

<sup>111</sup> *Id.*

<sup>112</sup> *Id.*

<sup>113</sup> *Id.*

<sup>114</sup> *Id.*

able to benefit from exposure to another culture while still being able to develop their own native language and maintain their native culture as well.<sup>115</sup>

## VII. CONCLUSION

Because of the benefits of TWI programs for both ELL and non-ELL students, this type of program could be used as an enrichment tool for both groups of students.<sup>116</sup> While ESL and other programs that separate ELLs from the mainstream students carry a stigma of being a public handout for immigrant families, TWI programs have a more positive appeal.<sup>117</sup> These programs offer native English speakers an opportunity to learn a second language and pursue their own academic endeavors, while also helping minority students become bilingual and thrive academically.<sup>118</sup> In turn, a more integrated environment is created.<sup>119</sup> Bringing in this viewpoint of openness, inclusion, and exploration of other cultures is not only advantageous from an academic standpoint, but also from a social standpoint.<sup>120</sup> TWI programs allow both ELL and non-ELL students to thrive culturally, socially, and academically, closing the achievement gap and creating students that are bilingual, bicultural, and bi-literate.<sup>121</sup>

---

<sup>115</sup> Alanis, *supra* note 34.

<sup>116</sup> Marian, *supra* note 108, at 168.

<sup>117</sup> Teresa Watanabe, *Dual-Language Immersion Programs Growing in Popularity*, L.A. Times (May 8, 2011), <http://articles.latimes.com/2011/may/08/local/la-me-bilingual-20110508>.

<sup>118</sup> *Id.*

<sup>119</sup> *Id.*

<sup>120</sup> Collier, *supra* note 68.

<sup>121</sup> Collier, *supra* note 13.